

#### LACKAWANNA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY'S OFFICE

## MARK POWELL

RECEIVED

July 27, 2023

AUG 0 4 2023

OFFICE OF OPEN RECORDS

John P. Finnerty, ESQ DLP 75 Glenmaura National Blvd. Moosic, Pa 18507

#### Dear Sir:

Pursuant to 65 P.S. §§67.503(b)(d), the Right-To-Know Law ("RTKL"), 65 P.S. §§67.101-3104 requires the Lackawanna County District Attorney's Office have an appeals officer designated for hearing appeals involved the RTKL.

Be advised, I serve in this capacity for the Lackawanna County District Attorney's Office. Recently, the Office of Open Records ("OOR") issued a final order transferring a RTKL appeal in the matter of John P. Finnerty v. Jessup Borough, OOR Dkt. AP 2023-1425 to the Lackawanna County District Attorney's for final determination. Documents enclosed herewith.

Having carefully reviewed the request from Attorney John P. Finnerty, who is seeking records pertaining to a dash cam video of a motor vehicle accident that occurred on May 19, 2023 in the Borough of Jessup. Specifically, please refer to the Open Records Request filed by Attorney Finnerty.

It is my decision that the records requested are exempt under the Pa RTKL, specifically Section 708(b)(16). This dash cam video is related to a criminal investigation by the Jessup Police Department regarding a motor vehicle accident, and therefore, exempt under Section 708(b)(16). As such, your request is DENIED.

In closing, within 30 days of the mailing date of this final determination, you may appeal to the Lackawanna County Court of Common Pleas.

Sincerely,

Gene Riccardo, ESQ,

RTKL Appeals Officer

Lackawanna County District Attorney's Office

GR/bf Enclosure(s)

Cc: Joshua Young, ESQ Office of Open Records

Sent via: USPS-Regular/Certified mail



## VIA FIRST CLASS MAIL

June 28, 2023

Appeals Officer Lackawanna County District Attorney's Office 135 Jefferson Avenue Scranton, PA 18503

Re: *John Finnerty v. Jessup Borough* OOR Dkt. 2023-1425

Dear Appeals Officer:

Pursuant to 65 P.S. §§ 67.503(b)-(d), the Right-to-Know Law ("RTKL"), 65 P.S. §§ 67.101-.3104, requires that you have an Appeals Officer designated for hearing appeals involving the RTKL. The Office of Open Records ("OOR") has issued a final determination transferring a RTKL appeal to your jurisdiction.

The OOR's final determination and a complete record of the appeal received by the OOR are included with this correspondence.

Please contact me with any questions.

/s/ Joshua Young

Joshua Young Senior Deputy Chief Counsel



# FINAL DETERMINATION

IN THE MATTER OF

JOHN FINNERTY, Requester

v. : Docket No.: AP 2023-1425

JESSUP BOROUGH, Respondent

On June 14, 2023, John Finnerty ("Requester") filed a request ("Request") with Jessup Borough ("Borough") pursuant to the Right-to-Know Law ("RTKL"), 65 P.S. §§ 67.101 *et seq.*, seeking dash cam video relating to a motor vehicle accident that occurred on May 19, 2023. The Borough denied the Request on June 21, 2023, stating that the records are related to a criminal investigation. *See* 65 P.S. § 67.708(b)(16). On June 23, 2023, the Requester appealed to the Office of Open Records ("OOR").

The Borough is a local law enforcement agency, and the Request, by its very wording, seeks records concerning a criminal investigation. The OOR does not have jurisdiction to hear appeals related to criminal investigative records held by local law enforcement agencies. See 65 P.S. § 67.503(d)(2). Instead, appeals involving records alleged to be criminal investigative records held by a local law enforcement agency are to be heard by an appeals officer designated by the local district attorney. See id. Accordingly, the appeal is hereby transferred to the Appeals Officer for the Lackawanna County District Attorney's Office ("District Attorney's Office") to determine

whether the records are subject to disclosure.<sup>1</sup> A copy of this final order and the appeal filed by the Requester will be sent to the Appeals Officer for the District Attorney's Office.

For the foregoing reasons, Requester's appeal is **transferred** to the Appeals Officer for the District Attorney's Office. This Final Determination is binding on all parties. Within thirty days of the mailing date of this Final Determination, either party may appeal to the Lackawanna County Court of Common Pleas. 65 P.S. § 67.1302(a). All parties must be served with notice of the appeal. The OOR also shall be served notice and have an opportunity to respond as per Section 1303 of the RTKL. However, as the quasi-judicial tribunal adjudicating this matter, the OOR is not a proper party to any appeal and should not be named as a party. This Final Determination shall be placed on the OOR website at: <a href="https://openrecords.pa.gov">https://openrecords.pa.gov</a>.

FINAL DETERMINATION ISSUED AND MAILED: June 28, 2023

/s/ Joshua Young

Senior Deputy Chief Counsel Joshua Young, Esq.

Sent to: Requester (via email), Open Records Officer (via email), Appeals Officer for the Lackawanna County District Attorney's Office (via first class mail)

The Commonwealth Court has noted that the OOR has the authority to transfer an appeal to "where [a requester] should have initially appealed." See Phila. Dist. Attorney's Office v. Williams, 204 A.3d 1062, \*4 n.5 (Pa. Commw. Ct. 2019) ("... [A]Ithough the onus for appealing from an RTKL denial to the proper appeals officer is on the requester, the OOR did not violate the law or any procedure in redirecting the appeal in this case").

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Padgett v. Pa. State Police, 73 A.3d 644, 648 n.5 (Pa. Commw. Ct. 2013).

# BOROUGH OF JESSUP

Lackawanna County

395 Lane Street Jessup, PA 18434 Website: jessupborough.com Phone: 570-489-0411 Fax: 570-489-6899

Email: jessupborough@comcast.net

June 21, 2023

John P. Finnerty, Esquire DLP 75 Glenmaura National Blvd. Moosic, PA 18507 ifinnerty@dlplaw.com phone 570.347.1011 fax 570.347.7028

Dear Atty. Finnerty,

Thank you for writing to the Borough of Jessup with your request for information pursuant to the Right-to-Know Law (RTKL), 65 PS 67 101, et.seq. This office received your request on June 14, 2023 for:

Copy of the dash cam video of a motor vehicle accident that occurred on May 19, 2023 on Hill Street in Jessup Borough. The parties involved in the accident were Daniel Karsnak (driver) and Alan Ritzco (pedestrian). The dash cam video is from Mr. Karsnak's vehicle.

Under the Right to Know Law (RTKL), records in possession of an agency are presumed public unless they are exempt under Section 708 of the RTKL. Section 708(b)(16) of the RTKL protects the disclosure of "a record of an agency relating to or resulting in a criminal investigation, including investigative materials, notes, correspondence, videos, and reports." See, 65 P.S. Section 67.708(b)(16). The Pennsylvania Commonwealth Court, in Pa. State Police v. Kim, 150 A.3d 155 (Pa. Cmwlth. 2016), held that an injured passenger was not entitled to surveillance video obtained by a policy agency from a private party because the video was related to a criminal investigation by the police agency and, therefore, exempt under Section 708(b)(16).

Here, the record you've requested is exempt from disclosure pursuant to Section 708(b)(16) and the <u>Kim</u> case because the video did not become a record accessible from the Borough until the Jessup Police Department undertook a criminal investigation of the crash. Thus, the video is related to the Jessup Police Department's criminal investigation of this matter and not subject to disclosure. For these reasons, your request is denied.

You have a right to appeal this denial of information in writing to: Office of Open Records, 333 Market St., 16th Floor, Harrisburg, PA 17101-2234. Appeals can also be filed online at the Office of Open Records website, <a href="https://www.openrecords.pa.gov">https://www.openrecords.pa.gov</a>.

If you choose to file an appeal you must do so within 15 business days of the mailing date of the agency's response. See 65 P.S. § 67.1101. Please note that a copy of your original Right To Know request and this denial letter must be included when filing an appeal. More information about how to file an appeal under the RTKL is available at the Office of Open Records website, <a href="https://www.openrecords.pa.gov">https://www.openrecords.pa.gov</a>.

If you have additional questions, please contact Mia Stine. This correspondence will serve to close this record with our office as permitted by law.

Respectfully Submitted,

Mia Stine

Open Records Officer



# Standard Right-to-Know Law Request Form

Good communication is vital in the RTKL process. Complete this form thoroughly and retain a copy; it may be required if an appeal is filed. You have 15 business days to appeal after a request is denied or deemed denied.

		o o o o o o o o o o o o o o o o o o o		-		
SUBMITTED TO AGENC	Y NAME: Jessup B	Sorough Police Depar	rtment			(Attn: AORO)
Date of Request: June 14,	2023	Submitted via:	Email	☐ U.S. Mail	☐ Fax	☐ In Person
PERSON MAKING REQU	EST:					
Name: John P. Finnerty, E	squire	Company (if	applicable	):		
Mailing Address: 75 Gleni						
City: Moosic			Email: JFi	nerty@dlplav	v.com	
		Fax:Fax:				
How do you prefer to be o						S. Mail
RECORDS REQUESTED: matter, time frame, and type are not required to exp!ain w Use additional pages if neces. Copy of the dash cam vide Jessup Borough. The part (pedestrian). The dash ca I can pick up a copy of the you may e-mail a copy of	e of record or party thy the records are s sary. The of a motor vehicles involved in the time video is from M the dash cam video i	names. RTKL requests ought or the intended cle accident that occ accident were Dani Ir. Karsnak's vehicle f it is downloaded to	s should seed use of the re curred on M iel Karsnak	k records, not a ecords unless of lay 19, 2023 ( (driver) and a	sk questie herwise r on Hill St Alana Rit	ons. Requesters required by law. reet in zco
<b>DO YOU WANT COPIES?</b> Do you want <u>certified cop</u>	☐ Yes, electroni ☐ No, in-person ies? ☐ Yes (may )	c copies preferred in inspection of record be subject to addition	if available rds preferr onal costs)	ed ( <i>may requ</i> e		
RTKL requests may require Please notify me if fees a						
Please notify me if lees a		THIS LINE FOR AC				
Tracking:	_ Date Received:	R	lesponse D	ue (5 bus. day	/s):	
30-Day Ext.? 🗆 Yes 🗆 No	(If Yes, Final Due	Date:	) Actua	l Response Da	ate:	
Request was: 🗆 Granted	☐ Partially Gran	ted & Denied 🗆 D	enied Cos	t to Requeste	r:\$	
Appropriate third parti	es notified and giv	ven an opportunity	to object t	o the release	of reque	sted records.
			4		Carra unda	444 Fab 2 2020

NOTE: In most cases, a completed RTKL request form is a public record. More information about the RTKL is available at https://www.openrecords.pa.gov Form updated Feb. 3, 2020

# Agency:

Appeal Officer Lackawanna County District Attorney's Office 135 Jefferson Avenue Scranton, PA 18503 From:

no-reply@openrecordspennsylvania.com

To:

ifinnerty@dlplaw.com

Subject:

[External] PA Office of Open Records - Appeal Confirmation

Date:

Friday, June 23, 2023 3:15:08 PM

Attachments:

oor logo email.png

ATTENTION: This email message is from an external sender. Do not open links or attachments from unknown senders. To report suspicious email, use the Report Phishing button in Outlook.



You have filed an appeal of an agency's response to a request for records under the Right-to-Know Law.

Name:

John Finnerty

Company:

Dougherty, Leventhal & Price, LLP

Address 1:

75 Glenmaura National Blvd.

Address 2:

City:

Moosic

State:

Pennsylvania

Zip:

18507

Phone:

570-347-1011

Email:

JFinnerty@dlplaw.com

Email2:

JFinnerty@dlplaw.com

Agency (list):

Jessup Borough

Agency Address 1:

395 Lane Street

**Agency Address 2:** 

**Agency City:** 

Jessup

**Agency State:** 

Pennsylvania

Agency Zip:

18434

**Agency Phone:** 

570-489-0411

Agency Email:

MStine@jessupborough.org

Records at Issue in

this Appeal:

Copy of dash cam video of a motor vehicle accident that occurred on May 19, 2023 on Hill Street in Jessup Borough. The parties involved in the accident were Daniel Karsnak (driver) and Alana Ritzco (pedestrian). The dash cam video is from Mr. Karsnak's

vehicle.

**Request Submitted** 

e-mail

to Agency Via: Request Date:

06/14/2023

Response Date:

06/21/2023

Deemed Denied:

No

**Agency Open** 

Mia Stine

**Records Officer:** 

Attached a copy of

Yes

my request for

records:

Attached a copy of

Yes

all responses from the Agency regarding

my request:

Attached any letters or notices extending

respond to my

request:

No

the Agency's time to

No

Agree to permit the OOR additional time

to issue a final determination:

No

resolving this issue

through OOR

Interested in

mediation:

Attachments:

• 20230623140004.pdf

• 20230623140012.pdf

I requested the listed records from the Agency named above. By submitting this form, I am appealing the Agency's denial, partial denial, or deemed denial because the requested records are public records in the possession, custody or control of the Agency; the records do not qualify for any exemptions under § 708 of the RTKL, are not protected by a privilege, and are not exempt under any Federal or State law or regulation; and the request was sufficiently specific.

<sup>333</sup> Market Street, 16<sup>th</sup> Floor | Harrisburg, PA 17101-2234 | 717.346.9903 | F 717.425.5343 | <u>openrecords.pa.gov</u>



SFELLE OF OPEN REWARDS
353 MARKEY ST.
16 74 FLING/
HAVIETSBUING DA 1710/
1994. NOSHOA SENDE

LACKAWAMA COUNTY
BROTRUCT ATTORNEY'S OFFICE
135 JEFFERSON AVENUE
SCRAMTOR, M. 1850S